arXiv:1005.1183v1 [math.ST] 7 May 2010

Two Sample Covariances from a Trivariate Normal Distribution

Steven Finch

May 7, 2010

Abstract. The joint distribution of two off-diagonal Wishart matrix elements was useful in recent work on geometric probability [12]. Not finding such formulas in the literature, we report these here.

Let (A, B, C) be trivariate normally distributed with known mean $(0, 0, 0)$ and covariance matrix

$$\Sigma = \operatorname{Cov}\left(\begin{pmatrix} A \\ B \\ C \end{pmatrix}\right) = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \sigma & \rho \\ \sigma & 1 & \rho \\ \rho & \rho & 1 \end{pmatrix}, \qquad 1-\sigma^2 > 0, \qquad 1-2\rho^2+\sigma > 0.$$

We wish to evaluate the probability that $AC < x$ and $BC < y$. On the one hand, the joint density of (AC, BC) is [1]

$$f(x,y) = \frac{1}{2\pi}\frac{\exp\left(\frac{1}{\xi}\left(\rho x + \rho y - \sqrt{\eta}\sqrt{(1-\rho^2)x^2 - 2(-\rho^2+\sigma)xy + (1-\rho^2)y^2}\right)\right)}{\sqrt{(1-\rho^2)x^2 - 2(-\rho^2+\sigma)xy + (1-\rho^2)y^2}}$$

where $\xi = 1-2\rho^2+\sigma$, $\eta = (1+\sigma)/(1-\sigma)$. On the other hand, $(A^2, 2AB, 2AC, B^2, 2BC, C^2)$ is pseudo-Wishart distributed with 1 degree of freedom and thus (AC, BC) has characteristic function [2]

$$\begin{aligned} F(u,v) &= \left(\det\left[\begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} - 2i\begin{pmatrix} 1 & \sigma & \rho \\ \sigma & 1 & \rho \\ \rho & \rho & 1 \end{pmatrix}\begin{pmatrix} 0 & 0 & u/2 \\ 0 & 0 & v/2 \\ u/2 & v/2 & 0 \end{pmatrix}\right]\right)^{-1/2} \\ &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{1+(1-\rho^2)u^2 - 2i\rho u + (1-\rho^2)v^2 - 2i\rho v + 2(-\rho^2+\sigma)uv}}. \end{aligned}$$

Our first task is to confirm that $f(x, y)$ and $F(u, v)$ are indeed a Fourier transform pair.

---

[0] Copyright © 2010 by Steven R. Finch. All rights reserved.

Now let (A_1, B_1, C_1), (A_2, B_2, C_2), …, (A_n, B_n, C_n) be a random sample from $N(0, \Sigma)$ and define sample covariances

$$\hat{\gamma}_{A,C} = \sum_{j=1}^{n} A_j C_j, \qquad \hat{\gamma}_{B,C} = \sum_{j=1}^{n} B_j C_j.$$

The marginal density for $\hat{\gamma}_{A,C}$ is well-known [3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10]:

$$\frac{|x/2|^{(n-1)/2}}{\sqrt{\pi}\sqrt{1-\rho^2}\,\Gamma\left(n/2\right)} \exp\left(\frac{\rho x}{1-\rho^2}\right) K_{(n-1)/2}\left(\frac{|x|}{1-\rho^2}\right)$$

and likewise for $\hat{\gamma}_{B,C}$, where $K_{(n-1)/2}(\theta)$ is the modified Bessel function of the second kind. The joint density $f_n(x, y)$, however, is not fully understood [11] even though

$$F_n(u, v) = \frac{1}{\left[1 + (1-\rho^2)u^2 - 2i\rho u + (1-\rho^2)v^2 - 2i\rho v + 2(-\rho^2+\sigma)uv\right]^{n/2}}$$

is comparatively simple. We shall determine $f_n(x, y)$ for $n = 2, 3, 4$ and then for arbitrary n, closing an evidently open issue. A special case involving $f_3(x, y)$ was examined in [12], for which $\rho = \sigma = 1/2$, to answer a geometric probability question. Our discussion generalizes this earlier work.

1. FOURIER TRANSFORM PAIR

Our objective is to evaluate the integral:

$$F(u, v) = \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{\exp\left(\frac{1}{\xi}\left((\rho + i\xi u)x + (\rho + i\xi v)y - \sqrt{\eta}\sqrt{ax^2 - 2bxy + ay^2}\right)\right)}{\sqrt{ax^2 - bxy + ay^2}} dx\, dy$$

where $a = 1 - \rho^2$, $b = -\rho^2 + \sigma$. Let

$$x = \frac{r}{\sqrt{2}}\left(\lambda\cos(\theta) - \kappa\sin(\theta)\right), \qquad y = \frac{r}{\sqrt{2}}\left(\lambda\cos(\theta) + \kappa\sin(\theta)\right)$$

then $ax^2 - bxy + by^2 = r^2$ under the requirement that

$$\lambda = \frac{1}{\sqrt{1-\sigma}}, \qquad \kappa = \frac{1}{\sqrt{1 - 2\rho^2 + \sigma}}.$$

The Jacobian determinant is

$$\left(\frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\right)^2 \begin{vmatrix} \lambda\cos(\theta) - \kappa\sin(\theta) & r\left(-\lambda\sin(\theta) - \kappa\cos(\theta)\right) \\ \lambda\cos(\theta) + \kappa\sin(\theta) & r\left(-\lambda\sin(\theta) + \kappa\cos(\theta)\right) \end{vmatrix} = \lambda\kappa r$$

hence $dx\,dy = \lambda\kappa r\,dr\,d\theta$. We obtain

$$\begin{aligned}
F(u,v) &= \frac{\lambda\kappa}{2\pi}\int_0^{2\pi}\int_0^{\infty}\exp\left(\frac{1}{\xi}\frac{r}{\sqrt{2}}\left[(\rho+i\xi u)\left(\lambda\cos(\theta)-\kappa\sin(\theta)\right)\right.\right.\\
&\qquad\left.\left. +(\rho+i\xi v)\left(\lambda\cos(\theta)+\kappa\sin(\theta)\right)-\sqrt{2\eta}\right]\right)dr\,d\theta\\
&= \frac{\lambda\kappa}{2\pi}\int_0^{2\pi}\int_0^{\infty}\exp\left(\frac{1}{\xi}\frac{r}{\sqrt{2}}\left[2\lambda\rho\cos(\theta)+i\lambda\xi(u+v)\cos(\theta)-i\kappa\xi(u-v)\sin(\theta)-\sqrt{2\eta}\right]\right)dr\,d\theta\\
&= -\frac{\lambda\kappa\xi}{\sqrt{2}\pi}\int_0^{2\pi}\frac{1}{2\lambda\rho\cos(\theta)+i\lambda\xi(u+v)\cos(\theta)-i\kappa\xi(u-v)\sin(\theta)-\sqrt{2\eta}}d\theta
\end{aligned}$$

since

$$\begin{aligned}
\mathrm{Re}\left[2\lambda\rho\cos(\theta)+i\lambda\xi(u+v)\cos(\theta)-i\kappa\xi(u-v)\sin(\theta)-\sqrt{2\eta}\right] &= 2\lambda\rho\cos(\theta)-\sqrt{2\eta}\\
&\leq 2\lambda\rho-\sqrt{2\eta}
\end{aligned}$$

and

$$4\lambda^2\rho^2-2\eta = 4\frac{1}{1-\sigma}\rho^2-2\frac{1+\sigma}{1-\sigma} = -\frac{2}{1-\sigma}\left(1-2\rho^2+\sigma\right) < 0.$$

Let $z=\exp(i\,\theta)$, then $d\theta = -i\,dz/z$ and

$$\begin{aligned}
F(u,v) &= \frac{i\lambda\kappa\xi}{\sqrt{2}\pi}\int_C\frac{1}{2\lambda\rho\frac{1}{2}(z+\frac{1}{z})+i\lambda\xi(u+v)\frac{1}{2}(z+\frac{1}{z})-i\kappa\xi(u-v)\frac{1}{2i}(z-\frac{1}{z})-\sqrt{2\eta}}\frac{dz}{z}\\
&= \frac{\sqrt{2}i\lambda\kappa\xi}{\pi}\int_C\frac{1}{2\lambda\rho(z^2+1)+i\lambda\xi(u+v)(z^2+1)-\kappa\xi(u-v)(z^2-1)-2\sqrt{2\eta}z}dz.
\end{aligned}$$

The denominator of the integrand can be rewritten as

$$(2\lambda\rho-\kappa\xi u+\kappa\xi v+i\lambda\xi u+i\lambda\xi v)z^2-2\sqrt{2\eta}z+(2\lambda\rho+\kappa\xi u-\kappa\xi v+i\lambda\xi u+i\lambda\xi v).$$

Let $\delta = 2\rho/\xi$. The two poles z_{pos}, z_{neg} of the integrand are

$$\begin{aligned}
&\frac{2\sqrt{2\eta}\pm\sqrt{8\eta-4(2\lambda\rho-\kappa\xi u+\kappa\xi v+i\lambda\xi u+i\lambda\xi v)(2\lambda\rho+\kappa\xi u-\kappa\xi v+i\lambda\xi u+i\lambda\xi v)}}{2(2\lambda\rho-\kappa\xi u+\kappa\xi v+i\lambda\xi u+i\lambda\xi v)}\\
=\;&\frac{\sqrt{2\eta}\pm\sqrt{\lambda^2\xi^2(u+v-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2\xi^2(-u+v)^2+2\eta}}{2\lambda\rho-\kappa\xi u+\kappa\xi v+i\lambda\xi u+i\lambda\xi v}
\end{aligned}$$

and z_{neg} is always inside C, z_{pos} is always outside. Clearly z_{neg} is a pole of order 1 and the associated residue is

$$\begin{aligned}
&\lim_{z\to z_{\text{neg}}} \frac{1}{(2\lambda\rho-\kappa\xi u+\kappa\xi v+i\lambda\xi u+i\lambda\xi v)(z-z_{\text{pos}})} \\
= \quad & -\frac{1}{2}\frac{1}{\sqrt{\lambda^2\xi^2(u+v-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2\xi^2(-u+v)^2+2\eta}};
\end{aligned}$$

multiplying by $(2\pi i)(\sqrt{2}i\lambda\kappa\xi/\pi)$ gives

$$\begin{aligned}
&\frac{\sqrt{2}\lambda\kappa\xi}{\sqrt{\lambda^2\xi^2(u+v-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2\xi^2(-u+v)^2+2\eta}} \\
= \quad & \frac{\sqrt{2}\lambda\kappa}{\sqrt{\lambda^2(u+v-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2(-u+v)^2+\alpha^2}}
\end{aligned}$$

where $\alpha=\sqrt{2\eta}/\xi$. This is the most useful expression for our purposes. The original formula for $F(u,v)$ can now be confirmed.

For example, if $\rho=\sigma=1/2$, we have $\xi=1$, $\eta=3$, $\lambda=\sqrt{2}$, $\kappa=1$, $\delta=1$, $\alpha=\sqrt{6}$. In this special case, our expression for $F(u,v)$ becomes

$$\frac{2}{\sqrt{2(u+v-i)^2+(-u+v)^2+6}}=\frac{1}{\sqrt{(\frac{u}{2}-i)(3\frac{u}{2}+i)+(\frac{v}{2}-i)(3\frac{v}{2}+i)+2\frac{u}{2}\frac{v}{2}-1}}$$

and this is consistent with [12].

We can also argue in reverse, that is, evaluating instead the integral:

$$f(x,y)=\frac{\sqrt{2}\lambda\kappa}{(2\pi)^2}\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp(-iux-ivy)}{\sqrt{\lambda^2(u+v-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2(-u+v)^2+\alpha^2}}dv\,du.$$

Let $s=u+v$, $t=-u+v$, then $u=(s-t)/2$, $v=(s+t)/2$ and

$$\begin{aligned}
-iux-ivy &= -i\frac{s}{2}x+i\frac{t}{2}x-i\frac{s}{2}y-i\frac{t}{2}y \\
&= -i\frac{x+y}{2}s-i\frac{-x+y}{2}t;
\end{aligned}$$

hence

$$f(x,y)=\frac{\lambda\kappa}{\sqrt{2}(2\pi)^2}\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp\left(-i\frac{x+y}{2}s-i\frac{-x+y}{2}t\right)}{\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2t^2+\alpha^2}}dt\,ds$$

since the Jacobian determinant is 1/2. The inner integral is [13]

$$\int\limits_{-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{\exp\left(-i\frac{-x+y}{2}t\right)}{\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2t^2+\alpha^2}}dt = \frac{2}{\kappa}K_0\left(\frac{1}{\kappa}\left|\frac{-x+y}{2}\right|\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right).$$

Define

$$\gamma = \frac{1}{\kappa}\left|\frac{-x+y}{2}\right|,$$

then the outer integral is [13]

$$\begin{aligned}
&\int\limits_{-\infty}^{\infty} K_0\left(\gamma\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right)\exp\left(-i\frac{x+y}{2}s\right)ds \\
= \quad & \pi\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\frac{\exp\left(-\frac{\alpha}{\lambda}\sqrt{\gamma^2\lambda^2+\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\right)^2}\right)}{\sqrt{\gamma^2\lambda^2+\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\right)^2}} \\
= \quad & 2\pi\kappa\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\frac{\exp\left(-\frac{\alpha}{2\lambda\kappa}\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}\right)}{\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}}.
\end{aligned}$$

Multiplying by $(\lambda\kappa/(\sqrt{2}(2\pi)^2))\cdot(2/\kappa)$, we obtain

$$\frac{\lambda\kappa}{\sqrt{2}\pi}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\frac{\exp\left(-\frac{\alpha}{2\lambda\kappa}\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}\right)}{\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}}$$

and the original formula for $f(x,y)$ can now be confirmed. For example, if $\rho=\sigma=1/2$, the probability that both $AC>0$ and $BC>0$ is $1/2=0.5$.

2. Sample Size $n=2$

We wish to evaluate

$$f_2(x,y) = \frac{\lambda^2\kappa^2}{(2\pi)^2}\int\limits_{-\infty}^{\infty}\int\limits_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp\left(-i\frac{x+y}{2}s-i\frac{-x+y}{2}t\right)}{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2t^2+\alpha^2}dt\,ds.$$

The inner integral is [13]

$$\int\limits_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp\left(-i\frac{-x+y}{2}t\right)}{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2t^2+\alpha^2}dt = \frac{\pi}{\kappa}\frac{\exp\left(-\frac{1}{\kappa}\left|\frac{-x+y}{2}\right|\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right)}{\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}}$$

and the outer integral is [13]

$$
\begin{aligned}
&\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp\left(-\gamma\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right)}{\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}}\exp\left(-i\frac{x+y}{2}s\right)ds\\
&= \frac{2}{\lambda}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)K_0\left(\frac{\alpha}{\lambda}\sqrt{\gamma^2\lambda^2+\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\right)^2}\right)\\
&= \frac{2}{\lambda}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)K_0\left(\frac{\alpha}{2\lambda\kappa}\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}\right).
\end{aligned}
$$

Multiplying by $(\lambda^2\kappa^2/(2\pi)^2))\cdot(\pi/\kappa)$, we obtain that $f_2(x,y)$ is

$$\frac{\lambda\kappa}{2\pi}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)K_0\left(\frac{\alpha}{2\lambda\kappa}\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}\right).$$

For example, if $\rho=\sigma=1/2$, the probability that both $\hat{\gamma}_{A,C}>0$ and $\hat{\gamma}_{B,C}>0$ is 0.608173447....

3. Sample Size $n = 3$

We wish to evaluate

$$f_3(x,y)=\frac{\sqrt{2}\lambda^3\kappa^3}{(2\pi)^2}\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp\left(-i\frac{x+y}{2}s-i\frac{-x+y}{2}t\right)}{\left(\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2t^2+\alpha^2\right)^{3/2}}dt\,ds.$$

The inner integral is

$$
\begin{aligned}
\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp\left(-i\frac{-x+y}{2}t\right)}{\left(\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2t^2+\alpha^2\right)^{3/2}}dt &= -\frac{1}{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)}\frac{d}{ds}\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp\left(-i\frac{-x+y}{2}t\right)}{\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2t^2+\alpha^2}}dt\\
&= -\frac{1}{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)}\frac{d}{ds}\frac{2}{\kappa}K_0\left(\frac{1}{\kappa}\left|\frac{-x+y}{2}\right|\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right)\\
&= \frac{2}{\kappa^2}\left|\frac{-x+y}{2}\right|\frac{K_1\left(\frac{1}{\kappa}\left|\frac{-x+y}{2}\right|\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right)}{\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}}
\end{aligned}
$$

and the outer integral is [13]

$$
\begin{aligned}
&\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{K_1\left(\gamma\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right)}{\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}}\exp\left(-i\frac{x+y}{2}s\right)ds\\
&= \frac{\pi}{\alpha\gamma\lambda}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\exp\left(-\frac{\alpha}{\lambda}\sqrt{\gamma^2\lambda^2+\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\right)^2}\right)\\
&= \frac{\pi}{\alpha\gamma\lambda}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\exp\left(-\frac{\alpha}{2\lambda\kappa}\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}\right).
\end{aligned}
$$

Multiplying by $(\sqrt{2}\lambda^3\kappa^3/(2\pi)^2)\cdot(2\gamma/\kappa)$, we obtain that $f_3(x,y)$ is

$$\begin{aligned} & \frac{\lambda^2\kappa^2}{\sqrt{2}\pi\alpha}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\exp\left(-\frac{\alpha}{2\lambda\kappa}\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}\right) \\ = \; & \frac{1}{2\pi\sqrt{1-\sigma^2}}\exp\left(\frac{1}{\xi}\left(\rho x+\rho y-\sqrt{\eta}\sqrt{(1-\rho^2)x^2-2(-\rho^2+\sigma)xy+(1-\rho^2)y^2}\right)\right)\end{aligned}$$

which is remarkably simple. For example, if $\rho=\sigma=1/2$, the probability that both $\hat{\gamma}_{A,C}>0$ and $\hat{\gamma}_{B,C}>0$ is 0.6837762984....

4. Sample Size $n=4$

We wish to evaluate

$$f_4(x,y)=\frac{2\lambda^4\kappa^4}{(2\pi)^2}\int\limits_{-\infty}^{\infty}\int\limits_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp\left(-i\frac{x+y}{2}s-i\frac{-x+y}{2}t\right)}{\left(\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2t^2+\alpha^2\right)^2}dt\,ds.$$

The inner integral is [13]

$$\begin{aligned}\int\limits_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp\left(-i\frac{-x+y}{2}t\right)}{\left(\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2t^2+\alpha^2\right)^2}dt \;&=\; \frac{\pi}{2\kappa^2}\left|\frac{-x+y}{2}\right|\exp\left(-\frac{1}{\kappa}\left|\frac{-x+y}{2}\right|\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right)\cdot \\ &\qquad \left\{\frac{1}{\frac{1}{\kappa}\left|\frac{-x+y}{2}\right|\left(\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2\right)^{3/2}}+\frac{1}{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right\}\end{aligned}$$

and the outer integral is [13]

$$\begin{aligned} & \int\limits_{-\infty}^{\infty}\left\{\frac{1}{\gamma\left(\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2\right)^{3/2}}+\frac{1}{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right\}\exp\left(-\gamma\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right)\exp\left(-i\frac{x+y}{2}s\right)ds \\ = \; & \frac{2}{\alpha\gamma\lambda^2}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\sqrt{\gamma^2\lambda^2+\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\right)^2}K_1\left(\frac{\alpha}{\lambda}\sqrt{\gamma^2\lambda^2+\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\right)^2}\right) \\ = \; & \frac{1}{\alpha\gamma\lambda^2\kappa}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}K_1\left(\frac{\alpha}{2\lambda\kappa}\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}\right).\end{aligned}$$

Multiplying by $(2\lambda^4\kappa^4/(2\pi)^2)\cdot(\pi\gamma/(2\kappa))$, we obtain that $f_4(x,y)$ is

$$\frac{\lambda^2\kappa^2}{4\pi\alpha}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}K_1\left(\frac{\alpha}{2\lambda\kappa}\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}\right).$$

For example, if $\rho=\sigma=1/2$, the probability that both $\hat{\gamma}_{A,C}>0$ and $\hat{\gamma}_{B,C}>0$ is 0.7409625593....

5. Formula for Arbitrary n

We wish to evaluate

$$f_n(x,y) = \frac{2^{(n-2)/2}\lambda^n\kappa^n}{(2\pi)^2}\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp\left(-i\frac{x+y}{2}s - i\frac{-x+y}{2}t\right)}{\left(\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2t^2+\alpha^2\right)^{n/2}}dt\,ds.$$

The inner integral is [14, 15, 16]

$$\begin{aligned}\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{\exp\left(-i\frac{-x+y}{2}t\right)}{\left(\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\kappa^2t^2+\alpha^2\right)^{n/2}}dt &= \frac{\sqrt{2\pi}}{\Gamma(n/2)2^{(n-2)/2}}\frac{1}{\kappa^{(n+1)/2}}\left|\frac{-x+y}{2}\right|^{(n-1)/2}\frac{1}{\left(\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2\right)^{(n-1)/4}}\\ &\quad\cdot K_{(n-1)/2}\left(\frac{1}{\kappa}\left|\frac{-x+y}{2}\right|\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right)\end{aligned}$$

and the outer integral is [13]

$$\begin{aligned}&\int_{-\infty}^{\infty}\frac{K_{(n-1)/2}\left(\gamma\sqrt{\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2}\right)}{\left(\lambda^2(s-i\delta)^2+\alpha^2\right)^{(n-1)/4}}\exp\left(-i\frac{x+y}{2}s\right)ds\\ &= \sqrt{\frac{\pi}{2}}\frac{2}{\alpha^{(n-2)/2}\gamma^{(n-1)/2}\lambda^{n/2}}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\left(\gamma^2\lambda^2+\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\right)^2\right)^{(n-2)/4}\\ &\quad\cdot K_{(n-2)/2}\left(\frac{\alpha}{\lambda}\sqrt{\gamma^2\lambda^2+\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\right)^2}\right)\\ &= \sqrt{\frac{\pi}{2}}\frac{1}{2^{(n-4)/2}\alpha^{(n-2)/2}\gamma^{(n-1)/2}\lambda^{n/2}\kappa^{(n-2)/2}}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\left(\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2\right)^{(n-2)/4}\\ &\quad\cdot K_{(n-2)/2}\left(\frac{\alpha}{2\lambda\kappa}\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}\right).\end{aligned}$$

Multiplying by

$$\frac{2^{(n-2)/2}\lambda^n\kappa^n}{(2\pi)^2}\cdot\frac{\sqrt{2\pi}}{\Gamma(n/2)2^{(n-2)/2}}\frac{1}{\kappa}\gamma^{(n-1)/2},$$

we obtain that $f_n(x,y)$ is

$$\begin{aligned}&\frac{1}{\Gamma(n/2)}\frac{\lambda^{n/2}\kappa^{n/2}}{2^{n/2}\pi\alpha^{(n-2)/2}}\exp\left(\frac{x+y}{2}\delta\right)\left(\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2\right)^{(n-2)/4}\\ &\cdot K_{(n-2)/2}\left(\frac{\alpha}{2\lambda\kappa}\sqrt{\kappa^2\left(x+y\right)^2+\lambda^2\left(x-y\right)^2}\right)\end{aligned}$$

which indeed generalizes the cases $n = 1, 2, 3, 4$ worked earlier. This result is asymptotically consistent with the following outcome of the Central Limit Theorem:

$$\begin{pmatrix}(\hat{\gamma}_{A,C}-n\rho)/\sqrt{n}\\ (\hat{\gamma}_{B,C}-n\rho)/\sqrt{n}\end{pmatrix}\sim N\left(\begin{pmatrix}0\\0\end{pmatrix},\begin{pmatrix}\rho^2+1 & \rho^2+\sigma\\ \rho^2+\sigma & \rho^2+1\end{pmatrix}\right)$$

as $n\to\infty$.

6. Closing Words

Testing the hypothesis $H_0 : \gamma_{A,C} = \gamma_{B,C}$ can be done by examining the difference

$$\hat{\gamma}_{A,C} - \hat{\gamma}_{B,C} = \hat{\gamma}_{A-B,C} = \sum_{j=1}^{n} (A_j - B_j) C_j .$$

If H_0 is true, then

$$\begin{pmatrix} A-B \\ C \end{pmatrix} \sim N\left(\begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}, \begin{pmatrix} 2-2\sigma & 0 \\ 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} \right)$$

and is independent of ρ; further, the density of $\hat{\gamma}_{A-B,C}$ is

$$\frac{|x/2|^{(n-1)/2}}{\sqrt{\pi}\,(2-2\sigma)^{(n+1)/4}\,\Gamma(n/2)} K_{(n-1)/2}\left(\frac{|x|}{\sqrt{2-2\sigma}} \right)$$

via known results [7] on Gaussian inner products. A considerable literature exists on the harder problem of testing $\tilde{H}_0 : \rho_{A,C} = \rho_{B,C}$ where variances are unknown and underlying distributions might not be normal [17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 34, 35, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 47, 48, 49, 50].

We have not attempted to evaluate the inverse Fourier transform of

$$G(u,v) = \left(\det \left[\begin{pmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 1 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 & 1 \end{pmatrix} - 2i \begin{pmatrix} 1 & \sigma & \rho \\ \sigma & 1 & \rho \\ \rho & \rho & 1 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 0 & u/2 & v/2 \\ u/2 & 0 & w/2 \\ v/2 & w/2 & 0 \end{pmatrix} \right] \right)^{-1/2} .$$

There is no analog of Miller's result [1], as far as we know, giving a joint density $g(x,y,z)$ for (AB, AC, BC). Hence no distributional insight on $(\hat{\gamma}_{A,B}, \hat{\gamma}_{A,C}, \hat{\gamma}_{B,C})$ seems to be available here. Interestingly, a formula for a joint density for $(\hat{\rho}_{A,B}, \hat{\rho}_{A,C}, \hat{\rho}_{B,C})$ is outlined in [51, 52] – evidently a sample size > 4 is presumed – and details still need to come together.

7. Acknowledgement

I am grateful to Robert Israel for a helpful discussion about residue calculus. Much more relevant material can be found at [53, 54], including experimental computer runs that aided theoretical discussion here.

References

[1] K. S. Miller, Some multivariate density functions of products of Gaussian variates, *Biometrika* 52 (1965) 645–646; MR0207014 (34 #6830).

[2] T. W. Anderson, *An Introduction to Multivariate Statistical Analysis*, 3rd ed., Wiley, 2003, pp. 258–259; MR1990662 (2004c:62001) .

[3] K. Pearson, G. B. Jeffery and E. M. Elderton, On the distribution of the first product moment-coefficient, in samples drawn from an indefinitely large normal population, *Biometrika* 21 (1929) 164–193.

[4] J. Wishart and M. S. Bartlett, The distribution of second order moment statistics in a normal system, *Proc. Cambridge Philos. Soc.* 28 (1932) 455–459.

[5] H. O. Hirschfeld, The distribution of the ratio of covariance estimates in two samples drawn from normal bivariate populations, *Biometrika* 29 (1937) 65–79.

[6] P. C. Mahalanobis, R. C. Bose and S. N. Roy, Normalization of statistical variates and the use of rectangular coordinates in the theory of sampling distributions, *Sankhya* 3 (1937) 1–40.

[7] L. E. Blumenson and K. S. Miller, Properties of generalized Rayleigh distributions, *Annals Math. Statist.* 34 (1963) 903–910; MR0150860 (27 #846).

[8] S. J. Press, On the sample covariance from a bivariate normal distribution, *Annals Inst. Statist. Math.* 19 (1967) 355–361; MR0219160 (36 #2243).

[9] M. D. Springer, *The Algebra of Random Variables*, Wiley, 1979, pp. 339–343; MR0519342 (80h:60029).

[10] A. H. Joarder and M. H. Omar, Some characteristics of sample covariance, technical report (2008), http://www.kfupm.edu.sa/math/.

[11] S. J. Press, *Applied Multivariate Analysis*, 2nd ed., Krieger, 1982, pp. 107–113; MR0420970 (54 #8979).

[12] S. Finch, Random Gaussian tetrahedra, http://arxiv.org/abs/1005.1033.

[13] I. S. Gradshteyn and I. M. Ryzhik, *Table of Integrals, Series, and Products*, 7th ed., Elsevier/Academic Press, 2007, pp. 424, 427, 430, 435, 491, 722 & 738; MR2360010 (2008g:00005).

[14] T. M. MacRobert, The modified Bessel function $K_n(z)$, *Proc. Edinburgh Math. Soc.* 38 (1919) 10–19.

[15] G. N. Watson, *A Treatise on the Theory of Bessel Functions*, 2nd ed., Cambridge University Press, 1952, pp. 172–173, 181–183, 185–188; MR1349110 (96i:33010).

[16] M. Abramowitz and I. A. Stegun, *Handbook of Mathematical Functions with Formulas, Graphs, and Mathematical Tables*, Dover Publications, 1992, p. 376; MR1225604 (94b:00012).

[17] K. Pearson and L. N. G. Filon, Mathematical contributions to the theory of evolution, IV. On the probable errors of frequency constants and on the influence of random selection on variation and correlation, *Philos. Trans. Royal Soc. London Ser. A* 191 (1898) 229–311.

[18] H. Hotelling, The selection of variates for use in prediction with some comments on the general problem of nuisance parameters, *Annals Math. Statist.* 11 (1940) 271–283; MR0002756 (2,111a).

[19] E. J. Williams, The comparison of regression variables, *J. Royal Statis. Soc. Ser. B* 21 (1959) 396-399; MR0113255 (22 #4093).

[20] E. J. Williams, Significance of difference between two non-independent correlation coefficients, *Biometrics* 15 (1959) 135–136.

[21] E. J. Williams, *Regression Analysis*, Wiley, 1959, pp. 72–89; MR0112212 (22 #3066).

[22] D. N. Lawley, On testing a set of correlation coefficients for equality, *Annals Math. Statist.* 34 (1963) 149–151; MR0145617 (26 #3147).

[23] L. J. Gleser, On testing a set of correlation coefficients for equality: Some asymptotic results, *Biometrika* 55 (1968) 513–517.

[24] M. A. Aitkin, W. C. Nelson and K. H. Reinfurt, Tests for correlation matrices, *Biometrika* 55 (1968) 327–334; MR0232493 (38 #818).

[25] C. E. Davis and D. Quade, On comparing the correlations within two pairs of variables, *Biometrics* 24 (1968) 987–995.

[26] O. J. Dunn and V. Clark, Correlation coefficients measured on the same individuals, *J. Amer. Stat. Assoc.* 64 (1969) 366–377.

[27] L. C. A Corsten, On a test for the difference between two correlation coefficients, *Mededelingen Landbouwhogeschool Wageningen*, v. 70 (1970) n. 13, 1–21.

[28] I. Olkin, Correlations revisited, *Improving Experimental Design and Statistical Analysis*, Proc. 7th Phi Delta Kappa Symposium on Educational Research, Madison, ed. J. C. Stanley, Rand McNally, 1967, pp. 102–128.

[29] I. Olkin and M. Siotani, Asymptotic distribution of functions of a correlation matrix, *Essays in Probability and Statistics*, Shinko Tsusho, 1976, pp. 235–251; MR0603847 (82b:62061).

[30] G. F. Hendrickson, J. C. Stanley and J. R. Hills, Olkin's new Formula for significance of r_{13} vs. r_{23} compared with Hotelling's method, *Amer. Educational Research J.* 7 (1970) 189–195.

[31] G. F. Hendrickson and J. R. Collins, Note correcting the results in "Olkin's new Formula for significance of r_{13} vs. r_{23} compared with Hotelling's method", *Amer. Educational Research J.* 7 (1970) 639–641.

[32] O. J. Dunn and V. Clark, Comparison of tests of the equality of dependent correlation coefficients, *J. Amer. Stat. Assoc.* 66 (1971) 904–908.

[33] G. T. Duncan and M. W. J. Layard, A Monte-Carlo study of asymptotically robust tests for correlation coefficients, *Biometrika* 60 (1973) 551–558; MR0339407 (49 #4166).

[34] J. J. Neill and O. J. Dunn, Equality of dependent correlation coefficients, *Biometrics* 31 (1975) 531–543; MR0373162 (51 #9364).

[35] D. A. Wolfe, On testing equality of related correlation coefficients, *Biometrika* 63 (1976) 214–215.

[36] D. A. Wolfe, A distribution-free test for related correlation coefficients, *Technometrics* 19 (1977) 507–509.

[37] S. C. Choi, Tests of equality of dependent correlation coefficients, *Biometrika* 64 (1977) 645–647; MR0488495 (58 #8029).

[38] B. M. Bennett, On a test for equality of dependent correlation coefficients, *Statistische Hefte* 19 (1978) 71–76.

[39] J. E. Boyer and W. R. Schucany, On Wolfe's test for related correlation coefficients, technical report (1978); available online at http://smu.edu/statistics/TechReports/tech-rpts.asp.

[40] J. H. Steiger, Tests for comparing elements of a correlation matrix, *Psychological Bulletin* 87 (1980) 245–251.

[41] M. C. Yu and O. J. Dunn, Robust tests for the equality of two correlation coefficients: A Monte Carlo study, *Educational and Psychological Measurement* 42 (1982) 987–1004.

[42] J. E. Boyer, A. D. Palachek and W. R. Schucany, An empirical study of related correlation coefficients, *J. Educational Statistics* (1983) 75–86.

[43] X.-L. Meng, R. Rosenthal and D. B. Rubin, Comparing correlated correlation coefficients, *Psychological Bulletin* 111 (1992) 172–175.

[44] T. E. Raghunathan, R. Rosenthal and D. B. Rubin, Comparing correlated but nonoverlapping correlation coefficients, *Psychological Methods* 1 (1996) 178–183.

[45] T. E. Raghunathan, An approximate test for homogeneity of correlated correlation coefficients, *J. Quality & Quantity* 37 (2003) 99–110.

[46] K. May and J. B. Hittner, A note on statistics for comparing dependent correlations, *Psychological Reports* 80 (1997) 475–480.

[47] K. May and J. B. Hittner, Tests for comparing dependent correlations revisited: A Monte Carlo study, *J. Experimental Education* 65 (1997) 257–269.

[48] N. C. Silver, K. May and J. B. Hittner, A Monte Carlo evaluation of tests for comparing dependent correlations, *J. General Psychology* 130 (2003) 149–168.

[49] N. C. Silver, J. B. Hittner and K. May, Testing dependent correlations with nonoverlapping variables: A Monte Carlo simulation, *J. Experimental Education* 73 (2004) 53–69.

[50] R. Wilcox and T. Tian, Comparing dependent correlations, *J. General Psychology* 135 (2008) 105–112; available online at http://www.uh.edu/˜ttian/publications.htm.

[51] R. A. Fisher, The simultaneous distribution of correlation coefficients, *Sankhya Ser. A* 24 (1962) 1–8; MR0145605 (26 #3135).

[52] B. M. Bennett, On Fisher's distribution of the sample correlation coefficients from a multinormal population, *Sankhya Ser. B* 40 (1978) 111–113; MR0588745 (81i:62029).

[53] S. Finch, Random triangles. I–IV, unpublished essays (2010), http://algo.inria.fr/bsolve/.

[54] S. Finch, Simulations in R involving sample covariances and correlations, http://algo.inria.fr/csolve/rsimul.html.

Steven Finch
Dept. of Statistics
Harvard University
Cambridge, MA, USA
Steven.Finch@inria.fr